



# New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities associated with herbivore defence

Karen J. Marsh<sup>1</sup> (D), Ian R. Wallis<sup>1</sup>, Carsten Kulheim<sup>1</sup> (D), Robert Clark<sup>2</sup> (D), Dean Nicolle<sup>3</sup>, William J. Foley<sup>1</sup> Juha-Pekka Salminen<sup>4</sup>

<sup>1</sup>Research School of Biology, The Australian National University, Canberra, ACT 2601, Australia; <sup>2</sup>Research School of Finance, Actuarial Studies and Statistics, The Australian Nationa University, Canberra, ACT 2601, Australia; <sup>3</sup>Currency Creek Arboretum, PO Box 808, Melrose Park, SA 5039, Australia; <sup>4</sup>Natural Chemistry Research Group, Department of Chemis University of Turku, Turku FI-20500, Finland

Author for correspondence: Karen J. Marsh Tel: +612 6125 4140 Email: karen.marsh@anu.edu.au

Received: 7 March 2019 Accepted: 5 August 2019

New Phytologist (2019) doi: 10.1111/nph.16117

Key words: Eucalyptus leaves, herbivory, hydrolysable tannins, nitrogen digestibility, oxidative activity, polyphenols, proanthocyanidins, protein precipitation capacity.

## **Summary**

• Although tannins have been an important focus of studies of plant-animal interaction ditional tannin analyses cannot differentiate between the diversity of structures pre plants. This has limited our understanding of how different mixtures of these widespre. ondary metabolites contribute to variation in biological activity.

• We used UPLC-MS/MS to determine the concentration and broad composition of t and polyphenols in 628 eucalypt (Eucalyptus, Corymbia and Angophora) samples, and these to three in vitro functional measures believed to influence herbivore defence: precipitation capacity, oxidative activity at high pH and capacity to reduce in vitro ni (N) digestibility.

• Protein precipitation capacity was most strongly correlated with concentrations of pro din subunits in proanthocyanidins (PAs), and late-eluting ellagitannins. Capacity to in vitro N digestibility was affected most by the subunit composition and mean de; polymerisation (mDP) of PAs. Finally, concentrations of ellagitannins and prodelphinid units of PAs were the strongest determinants of oxidative activity.

• The results illustrate why measures of total tannins rarely correlate with animal f responses. However, they also confirm that the analytical techniques utilised here could researchers to understand how variation in tannins influence the ecology of individual populations of herbivores, and, ultimately, other ecosystem processes.

# **Introduction**

Biologists often assume that a primary role of tannins is to defend plants against herbivory. There are, however, thousands of tannin compounds displaying a diverse array of structures that often occur in complex mixtures of tens to hundreds of compounds. These structures not only influence the response to standard colorimetric assays (Schofield et al., 2001), but they also affect the biological activity of tannins, including their ability to bind proteins (Porter & Woodruffe, 1984; Jones & Palmer, 2000; Karonen et al., 2015), their pro- or antioxidant capacities (Barbehenn et al., 2006; Moilanen & Salminen, 2008; Moilanen et al., 2016), and, ultimately, their effects on herbivores (Ayres et al., 1997; Makkar, 2003; Mueller-Harvey, 2006; Roslin & Salminen, 2008). Consequently, the specific tannins present in a mixture, rather than just the total tannin concentration, are important in understanding biological consequences (Barbehenn et al., 2008; Moilanen & Salminen, 2008). However, it is difficult to

©2019 The Authors

characterise complex tannin mixtures, and therefore to at specific biological consequences to tannins. Some ecologis circumvented this problem by relating measures of herbiv functional attributes of tannins, such as their capacity to p tate protein (Robbins et al., 1987; e.g. McArt et al., 2009), nitrogen (N) digestibility (e.g. DeGabriel et al., 2009; et al., 2009) or oxidise at high pH (e.g. Appel, 1993; Stei et al., 2016; Marsh et al., 2017b).

Protein binding is the primary mechanism by which t are traditionally thought to affect mammalian herbivores. ecologists measure the capacity of tannins to precipitate dard amount of protein and use this as a functional mea tannin concentrations in forage. For example, Robbin (1987) were able to predict the *in vivo* digestible protein c of plants for mule deer (Odocoileus hemionus) and white deer (O. virginianus) from the in vitro protein precip capacity and total protein concentration of plant extracts. I McArt et al. (2009) demonstrated that reduced p

New Phytologist (2

New Phytologist ©2019 New Phytologist Trust This is an open access article under the terms of the Creative Commons Attribution License, which permits use, distribution and reproduction in any medium, provided the original work is properly cited.

# New Phyte

# 2 Research

availability due to protein precipitation by tannins could explain differences in productivity between moose (Alces alces) living in different regions.

DeGabriel et al. (2008) developed an alternative method to assess the capacity of tannins to constrain protein digestion in mammalian herbivores. Their method measures the in vitro digestibility of plant N in the presence and absence of polyethylene glycol (PEG), a polymer that preferentially binds to tannins and releases protein (Silanikove et al., 1996; Schofield et al., 2001). Using this method, DeGabriel et al. (2009) showed that the in vitro digestible N concentration of eucalypt foliage influenced the reproductive success of female common brushtail possums (Trichosurus vulpecula). As a consequence, in vitro digestible N concentrations have been used as indicators of the nutritional quality of habitat for marsupial folivores (DeGabriel et al., 2009; Youngentob et al., 2011; Windley et al., 2016).

In contrast to mammals, there is little evidence that tannins reduce the digestibility of protein in insect herbivores (Barbehenn & Constabel, 2011). The alkaline pH in the midgut of insects can prevent tannins from forming complexes with protein (Martin et al., 1985; Appel, 1993; Barbehenn & Constabel, 2011). This is not to say that tannins are harmless to insects. Instead, the alkaline conditions may promote the oxidation of tannins and other phenolic compounds, leading to the formation of oxygen radicals and, consequently, cell damage (Appel, 1993). For example, the larvae of some tropical lepidopteran species were found to contain the oxidation products of polyphenols in their frass (Vihakas et al., 2015). Likewise, Lymantria dispar, Orgyia Leucostigma and Malacosoma distria caterpillars that fed on maple leaves with high concentrations of ellagitannins had high levels of semiquinone radicals in their midguts together with increased protein carbonyl contents that suggested increased oxidation of the proteins in the gut (Barbehenn et al., 2005, 2013).

The above examples demonstrate that measuring the activity of polyphenol mixtures has provided a better indication of their probable effects in different biological systems compared with estimates of 'total tannins' or 'total phenolics'. Fortunately, new analytical techniques are now available that allow the broad characterisation of complex polyphenol mixtures in plants. For example, as part of a related study on the phylogeny of tannins in eucalypts, we used ultraperformance liquid chromatography tandem mass spectrometry (UPLC-MS/MS, i.e. the Engström method; Engström et al., 2014, 2015; Salminen, 2018b) to measure the concentrations of a range of phenolic subgroups, including four subgroups of tannins, in leaves from 628 eucalypts representing 515 species (Marsh et al., 2017a). This provides an ideal opportunity to examine the relationship between plant polyphenol composition and traditional in vitro measures of biological activity. Knowing what groups of tannins are active also improves our ability to identify the genetic architecture of tannin production. For example, Skovmand et al. (2018) recently argued that genes responsible for variations in tannins in plants may be 'keystone genes' that are critical to ecosystem function.

Eucalypts are the dominant forest and woodland trees in Australia, with c. 900 species belonging to the genera Eucalyptus, Angophora and Corymbia (Bayly et al., 2013). Eucalypt foliage

New Phytologist (2019)

makes up a large proportion of the diet of four species of pials - the koala (Phascolarctos cinereus), greater glider roides volans), common ringtail possum (Pseudocheirus pere and common brushtail possum (Trichosurus vulpecula) ( et al.,  $2004$ ) – and a wide variety of insect herbivores ( Morrow, 1981; Paine et al., 2011). Importantly, eucalyp tain variable concentrations and types of tannins and polyphenols, suggesting that there may also be significant tion in biological activity associated with herbivore of (Marsh et al., 2017a).

We had several expectations about how specific tanni groups would influence traditional measures of *in vitro* bio activity (protein precipitation capacity, oxidative activi capacity to reduce digestible N) of eucalypt samples (Ta However, we also understood that our hypotheses are c cated by the fact that individual tannins within the sam group can differ over six-fold in both their protein precip (Karonen et al., 2015) and their oxidative activities (Moila Salminen, 2008). Thus, differences in the types and con tions of individual tannins between eucalypt species could ence the degree of the response to the standard Nevertheless, we expected to reveal the major patterns b the tannin groups and their bioactivities, and hoped to set of the more detailed patterns within the tannin subgroups.

We anticipated that protein precipitation capacity wo positively correlated with the concentrations of proanthocy: (PAs; also known as condensed tannins), their mean dea

Table 1 The polyphenol constituents measured in this study, and th expected effects on biological activity.

		Expected eff biological act	
Constituent	Polyphenol class	PPC	OA
Small procyanidin	PA	$+$	
Medium procyanidin	РA	$+$	
Large procyanidin	PA	$^{++}$	
Small prodelphinidin	PA	$+$	$^{+}$
Medium prodelphinidin	PА	$++$	$^{+}$
Large prodelphinidin	PА	$+++$	$\ddot{}$
% prodelphinidin	PA	$+$	$^{+}$
mDP	PA	$++$	
Early-eluting HHDP derivatives	HТ		$^{+++}$
Late-eluting HHDP derivatives	НT	$^{+}$	$^{++}$
Early-eluting galloyl derivatives	НT		$^{++}$
Late-eluting galloyl derivatives	HТ	$^{++}$	$^{+}$
Kaempferol derivatives	Flavonol		
Quercetin derivatives	Flavonol		
Myricetin derivatives	Flavonol		$^{+}$
Quinic acid derivatives	Flavonoid		$^{+}$

A '+' indicates an expected positive relationship, with '++' and '+++ indicating the constituents hypothesised to have the strongest effect biological activity.

PA, proanthocyanidin; HT, hydrolysable tannin; PPC, protein precipitation capacity (mg  $g^{-1}$  DM pentagalloyl glucose equivalent:<br>OA, oxidative activity (mg  $g^{-1}$  DM gallic acid equivalents); CND, capacity to reduce N digestibility (percentage units); mDP, m degree of polymerisation of proanthocyanidins; HHDP, hexahydroxydiphenoyl.

New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities a... Page 4 of 22

www.newpnytologist.com

polymerisation (mDP) and the proportion of prodelphinidin subunits in PAs (Jones et al., 1976; Porter & Woodruffe, 1984; McManus et al., 1985; Aerts et al., 1999). At a finer scale, we used the Engström method (Engström et al., 2014) to measure PA concentrations at three cone voltages (see Salminen, 2018b), which provides additional information about the size distribution of PAs. We expected that large prodelphinidin-rich PAs in particular would contribute positively to the protein precipitation capacity of samples, assuming that these types of PAs were in sufficient concentrations in the extracts. Because most of the galloyl groups in our samples originate from monomeric ellagitannins or simple galloyl glucoses, rather than gallotannins (Marsh et al., 2017a), and because gallotannins have a better protein precipitation capacity compared with monomeric ellagitannins or simple galloyl glucoses (Haslam, 1988; Kawamoto et al., 1996; Kilkowski & Gross, 1999; Salminen & Karonen, 2011), we did not expect a strong correlation between protein precipitation capacity and galloylderivative concentrations as such, unless the galloyl derivatives were the main tannins of the species.

We hypothesised that the properties of tannins that affect protein precipitation capacity would also influence their capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility. The gut contains both exogenous protein from the diet and endogenous proteins, such as enzymes, sloughed mucosal cells and microbial protein. Tannins that precipitate any of these proteins will reduce the apparent digestibility of N. We therefore expected that the concentration, size and composition of PA molecules would strongly influence the capacity to reduce in vitro digestible N, and that there would be a positive correlation between protein precipitation capacity and capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility in eucalypts.

In contrast to the major role that PAs may play in influencing protein precipitation capacity and capacity to reduce N digestibility, we predicted that the concentration of hexahydroxydiphenoyl (HHDP) derivatives (i.e. ellagitannins), particularly those that elute earlier during UPLC separation, would drive the oxidative activity of eucalypt samples, if they are present at sufficient concentrations compared to other oxidatively active compounds in the samples. This is because ellagitannins appear to be the class of tannins that are most oxidatively active at high pH (Barbehenn et al., 2006; Moilanen & Salminen, 2008), and those with shorter UPLC retention times tend to oxidise more readily than those with longer retention times (Salminen et al., 2011; Moilanen et al., 2013). Other polyphenol constituents, including prodelphinidin subunits of PAs and myricetin derivatives, with pyrogallol-type substitution of the flavonoid B-ring, may also contribute to oxidative activity to a lesser extent (Vihakas et al.,  $2014$ ).

Our final prediction was that there would be a negative correlation between oxidative activity and protein precipitation capacity. This prediction was made for two reasons. First, hydrolysable tannins (HTs) with high protein precipitation capacity tend to have lower oxidative activity (Moilanen et al., 2013). And second, there is an inverse relationship between the concentrations of PAs and HTs in eucalypt leaves, probably because they compete for biosynthetic pathways (Marsh et al., 2017a). Given the expected reciprocal effects of PAs and HTs on oxidative activity and

 $\sim$ 

©2019 The Authors  $\ddot{\phantom{a}}$  protein precipitation capacity, protein precipitation capaci be higher in those samples dominated by PAs, while s dominated by HTs may be more oxidatively active.

 $R$ 

# **Materials and Methods**

The collection of 628 leaf samples (515 eucalypt species from allied genera Eucalyptus L'Her., Corymbia Hill & Johnson Angophora Cav. - duplicates of species were predominantly ent subspecies) from Currency Creek Arboretum, South At and the measurement of the phenolic composition of these s by UPLC-MS/MS is described in detail in Marsh et al. (2 Hydrolysable tannins (HHDP and galloyl derivatives), ho were re-integrated to determine concentrations of early-eluti late-eluting derivatives for each group. We used the dimeric tannin, oenothein B, as a marker to distinguish the dif between these two groups. The early-eluting HHDP and derivatives eluted before oenothein B (0.5-2.9 min), and th eluting ones were those from oenothein B onwards  $(2.9 -$ Likewise, we re-analysed the previously collected data to det the concentration of procyanidins and prodelphinidins in a the three size classes explained in Salminen (2018b). The procyanidin and prodelphinidin oligomers were detected b voltages of 75 and 55 V, the medium procyanidin and prode din oligomers and polymers by cone voltages of 85 and 80 the large procyanidin and prodelphinidin polymers by con ages of 140 and 130 V, respectively. A summary of the pl constituents that were measured is given in Table 1, alon their expected effects on biological activity.

## Protein precipitation capacity

The protein precipitation capacity of eucalypt extracts was tified by the radial diffusion assay (Hagerman, 1987) usin as the protein and pentagalloylglucose as the quantificatio dard. Briefly, the original, nondiluted eucalypt extract ( et al., 2017a) was concentrated two-fold via freeze-dryin redissolving into Milli-Q water. A 24 µl aliquot of this c trated extract was applied to three wells punched onto a Per filled with BSA-agar gel. The Petri dishes were covere parafilm and incubated at 30°C for 72 h to form reprod rings with tannins and BSA. The ring area was documented a camera on a tripod and measured by the IMAGEJ software

## Oxidative activity

The portion of total phenolics that was easily auto-oxid pH 10 was measured as both mg  $g^{-1}$  dry weight and as a p age of total phenolics using the method of Salminen & K (2011), calibrated with gallic acid. In short, the total pl content of 15x dilutions (Milli-Q water) of the original et extracts (Marsh et al., 2017a) and the pH 10-oxidised  $\epsilon$ were measured with a well-plate reader at 730 nm. The diff in the total phenolic concentrations between these measure revealed the level of easily oxidised phenolics in the sampl the oxidative activity in mg  $g^{-1}$  or in % of total phenolics).

New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities a... Page 7 of 22

# 4 Research

### Capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility

A subset of leaves from each tree were freeze dried and then ground in a Foss Cyclotec 1093 mill (Foss, Höganäs, Sweden) until they passed through a 1 mm sieve. The capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility was determined using a modified version of the method of DeGabriel et al. (2008). The method involves sequential digestion of samples of ground foliage in acid pepsin and cellulase in the presence and absence of polyethylene glycol 4000 (PEG), which binds to both HTs and PAs (Silanikove et al., 1996; Schofield et al., 2001).

For each sample,  $0.8050 \pm 0.0050$  g leaf powder was weighed into each of four Ankom F57 fibre filter bags (Ankom Technology, Macedon, NY, USA). Two bags per sample were placed into beakers (100 bags per beaker) containing 25 ml Tris-base buffer solution (pH 7.1) per bag with 33.33 g  $I^{-1}$  PEG. The remaining bags were placed into the buffer solution without PEG. Samples were incubated at 37°C for 24 h, after which they were washed thoroughly with water and dried to constant mass at 40°C. Bags were then placed into 25 ml per bag of 0.1 M HCl containing  $2 \text{ g}1^{-1}$  pepsin for 48 h at 37°C. Samples were removed from the pepsin solution and washed briefly, before a final incubation at 37°C for 24 h in 25 ml per bag of 100 mmol acetic acid buffer (pH 4.75) containing  $6.25$  g  $1^{-1}$  cellulase. Samples were washed thoroughly, dried at 40°C to constant mass and weighed.

After the digestion process, the N concentration was determined in  $120 \pm 20$  mg of residue from each bag, as well as in the original ground leaf samples, using a Leco Truspec C/N analyser (Leco Corporation, Sydney, NSW, Australia). These values were used to calculate the *in vitro* digestibility of N in the presence and absence of PEG. Any samples with a coefficient of variation > 5% between duplicate analyses were repeated. The capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility was calculated as the difference in N digestibility between samples incubated with and without PEG. The digestibility with PEG was used rather than total N, because the total N of a plant will never be completely digested, due to some of the N being bound in complex cell-wall polymers.

## Statistical methods

We compared the mean biological activity (protein precipitation capacity, oxidative activity and capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility) of eucalypt phylogenetic clades (see Marsh et al., 2017a for the allocation of species to clades) using the gls function in package NLME for R (Pinheiro et al., 2017) and Pagel's  $\lambda$ covariance structure (R package APE; Paradis et al., 2004) to account for the phylogenetic nonindependence of samples. For all analyses, the dataset and analyses were at the individual tree level, with multiple subspecies and trees observed for some species, while other species were observed only once. Pagel's  $\lambda$ model is equivalent to including a within-species error term in addition to phylogenetic between-species term, and so is suitable for data where there are multiple observations per species. We used Tukey contrasts to determine which clades differed significantly ( $P$ <0.05) from one another. Residuals were checked for normality and variance homogeneity in all models.

New Phytologist (2019)

We estimated correlations between protein precip capacity and oxidative activity, protein precipitation capac. capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility, and oxidative a and capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility using the co

New

Phyto

function in the APE package in R to take the phylogenetic r ness of species into account. Standard errors and t-statist the estimated correlations were calculated using a para bootstrap with 30 replicates under the null hypothesis of pendence, using simple phylogenetic regression models using the gls function in the APE package in R.

We also used the gls function to fit four regression mod each of the square root of protein precipitation capacity, tive activity and the square root of the capacity to red digestibility, while taking the phylogeny into account. The root transformation was applied to two of these three dep variables in order to better satisfy the assumption of norma tributed errors with equal variances. The first model fc dependent variable contained the intercept only. The model contained the total polyphenol concentration (the all measured constituents). The third model contained two total tannins (the sum of all constituents in the PA ar classes; Table 1) and total flavonols (the sum of all constitu the flavonol class; Table 1). The fourth model contained a vidual constituents listed in Table 1. We tested the significa the fourth model using likelihood ratio tests relative to the and third models, which are both submodels of it.

To explore which constituents were most important in p ing biological activity, we performed a backward selection of the covariates in the fourth model outlined in the p paragraph for each of the three transformed activities ba the significance of omitting variables as calculated using squared likelihood ratio test with a cutoff of 0.05 for signif So that models made biological sense, either the total contion of prodelphinidin (sum of the concentrations of p phinidin from small, medium and large PAs; Table allowed in the model or one or more of the separate medium or large concentrations of prodelphinidin. Cor tions of total prodelphinidin with prodelphinidin subgroup not allowed. The total procyanidin (or small, medium and total HHDP derivatives (or early and late) and total gall derivatives (or early and late) variables were treated sir Residuals were checked for normality and homogeneity of ances, and six outliers with high leverage were removed. included two samples with oxidative activity and three s with protein precipitation capacity almost double that of tl highest samples, and a sample which turned out to be an in regression models of *in vitro* N digestibility.

# **Results**

## In vitro polyphenol-derived biological activity

We found wide variation in the protein precipitation ca  $(0-229 \text{ mg g}^{-1}$  dry matter (DM) pentagalloyl glucose of lents), oxidative activity  $(2-94 \text{ mg g}^{-1} \text{ DM} \text{ gallic acid } \epsilon)$ lents, or 3-79% of total phenolics) and capacity to

New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activities a... Page 8 of 22

www.newpnytologist.com

*in vitro* N digestibility (0–89 percentage units) between eucalypt species (Table 2). Mean biological activity did not differ between phylogenetic clades when the relatedness of species was taken into account (Table 2).

The capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility was not correlated with either the oxidative activity ( $t = -0.95$ ,  $P = 0.341$ ) or protein precipitation capacity of eucalypt leaves  $(t=0.36,$  $P=0.719$ ). However, there was a positive correlation between the protein precipitation capacity and oxidative activity of samples ( $r=0.54$ ,  $t=3.90$ ,  $P<0.001$ ).

#### Polyphenol composition and protein precipitation capacity

The model containing all of the polyphenol constituents in Table 1 explained significantly more of the variation in the square root of protein precipitation capacity compared with models that contained only the total polyphenol concentration or a combination of the total tannin and total flavonol concentrations  $(P< 0.001$  for both model comparisons).

There were strong positive relationships between protein precipitation capacity and the concentrations of late-eluting HHDP derivatives (Fig. 1a), procyanidin subunits from polymeric PAs (Fig. 1b), galloyl derivatives and prodelphinidin subunits from medium-sized PAs (Table 3). Although the relationships were not as strong, the concentration of early-eluting HHDP derivatives and the mDP of PAs were negatively correlated with protein precipitation capacity (Table 3). Pagel's lambda for the model was 0.31 (likelihood ratio  $\chi^2 = 17.3$  on 1 degree of freedom,  $P < 0.001$ ).

#### Polyphenol composition and oxidative activity

The full model containing all measured polyphenol constituents explained significantly more variation in oxidative activity compared with either the total polyphenol concentration alone, or a

Table 2 The mean (range) biological activity of species belonging to different eucalypt clades.

Phylogenetic clade	n	PPC <sup>1</sup>	OA <sup>2</sup>	CND <sup>3</sup>
Angophora	5	$25(9 - 59)$	$21(6-40)$	$19(8-44)$
Corymbia I	19	$18(0 - 40)$	$16(5-30)$	$29(11 - 45)$
Corymbia II	13	$28(5 - 53)$	$19(6 - 34)$	$24(13-38)$
Eudesmia	10	$42(6-92)$	29 (10-50)	$40(1 - 89)$
Monocalyptus	79	$36(0 - 122)$	$19(4 - 56)$	$25(0 - 70)$
Symphyomyrtus I	32	$25(0 - 89)$	$12(2 - 51)$	$10(0-22)$
Symphyomyrtus II	97	$26(0 - 98)$	$19(3 - 48)$	$11(0-68)$
Symphyomyrtus III	125	43 (0-229)	$22(2 - 86)$	$9(0 - 38)$
Symphyomyrtus IV	76	$30(0 - 113)$	$22(2-94)$	$28(0-67)$
Symphyomyrtus V	166	40 (0-201)	$20(3 - 50)$	$10(0 - 58)$
Pagel's $\lambda$		0.46	0.77	0.82
F-statistic		0.99	1.65	1.60
P-value		0.453	0.091	0.103

<sup>1</sup>Protein precipitation capacity (mg  $g^{-1}$  DM pentagalloyl glucose equivalents).

<sup>2</sup>Oxidative activity (mg  $g^{-1}$  DM gallic acid equivalents).

<sup>3</sup>Capacity to reduce N digestibility (percentage units).

©2019 The Authors k.  $\sim$  combination of the total tannin and total flavonol con tions, with  $P < 0.001$  for both model comparisons.

 $\overline{\mathbf{R}}$ 

The total concentration of HHDP derivatives had strong effect on the oxidative activity of samples (Fig. 2a) there were also strong positive relationships between the ox activity of samples and the concentrations of prodelphinid units from large PAs (Fig. 2b), and early-eluting galloyl tives (Table 4). The mDP of PAs and the concentrati quercetin and quinic acid derivatives were also positively lated with oxidative activity, while the concentration of 1 phinidin subunits from medium-sized PAs was neg correlated (Table 4). Pagel's lambda for the model was 0.5% lihood ratio  $\chi^2$  = 21.9 on 1 degree of freedom, P< 0.001).

## Polyphenol composition and capacity to reduce in viti digestibility

The full model containing all measured polyphenol const explained significantly more of the variation of the square the capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility compare models containing only the total polyphenol concentratio combination of the total tannin and total flavonol concent  $(P<0.001$  for both model comparisons).

There were strong positive relationships between the ca to reduce in vitro N digestibility and the proportion of p phinidin in PAs (Fig. 3a), and the mDP of PAs (I Table 5). The concentration of PD in small PAs had a negative effect on the capacity to reduce in vitro N diges (Table 5). There was a weaker negative relationship betwe capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility and the concen of quercetin derivatives (Table 5). Pagel's lambda for the was 0.66 (likelihood ratio  $\chi^2$  = 72.0 on 1 degree of fre  $P < 0.001$ ).

#### **Discussion**

The current study demonstrates that quantifying tanni groups in complex polyphenol mixtures provides valuable mation about the biological activity of plant samples subgroup composition of tannins in eucalypt extracts exp significantly more of the variation in oxidative activity, 1 precipitation capacity and capacity to reduce in  $v_i$ digestibility compared with the sum of the concentrations measured constituents. This is not necessarily surprising, b eucalypt species with the same total polyphenol concen can have vastly different polyphenol profiles (Marsh 2017a). Nevertheless, researchers frequently (and often cessfully) attempt to relate total tannin concentrations example, various measures of herbivory (Ayres et al., 1997; et al., 2014; Masette et al., 2015; Volf et al., 2015; Feltor 2018).

Different tannin subgroups influenced different types logical activity, although not all of these correlations match expectations. For example, concentrations of late-eluting I derivatives (ellagitannins) were more strongly correlated protein precipitation capacity compared with concentrati



PA subunits. It is likely, however, that high concentrations of ellagitannins relative to PAs drove this association. Likewise, the size and composition of PAs, rather than their concentration, correlated most strongly with the capacity to reduce in vitro N

Table 3 Final statistical model showing the phenolic constituents that had a significant effect on the square root of protein precipitation capacity.

Model term	Parameter estimate	<b>SE</b>	t statistic	$P$ -value	Standardised coefficient
(Intercept) Late HHDP	2.393 0.120	0.439 0.006	5.45 18.94	< 0.001 < 0.001	0.882
Large procyanidin	0.219	0.018	11.89	< 0.001	0.298
Total galloyl	0.056	0.006	8.75	< 0.001	0.235
Medium prodelphinidin	0.178	0.022	8.17	< 0.001	0.209
Early HHDP mDP of PAs	$-0.027$ $-0.047$	0.010 0.018	$-2.73$ $-2.59$	0.007 0.010	$-0.112$ $-0.070$

Degrees of freedom for all *t*-statistics is 563 ( $n = 625$ ).

HHDP, hexahydroxydiphenoyl derivatives; mDP of PAs, mean degree of polymerisation of proanthocyanidins.

New Phytologist (2019)

Fig. 1 The relationship between the p precipitation capacity of eucalypt leav the two polyphenol constituents that strongest correlation with this measur  $(n = 628)$ : (a) late-eluting hexahydroxydiphenoyl (HHDP) deriva and (b) procyanidin subunits from pol proanthocyanidins (PAs). Note that th relationships are indicative only, becat they do not take into account other covariates or phylogenetic correlation the statistical model.

New

Phyto

digestibility. As expected, however, the concentration of tannins had the greatest effect on the oxidative activity of ples. This study significantly advances our understand structure–function relationships in natural plant tannin mi and demonstrates that modern analytical techniques sho incorporated into studies examining relationships betwee nins and herbivory. Below, we discuss the relationships b phenolic composition and biological activity in greater and the implications for herbivores consuming foliage.

Protein precipitation by tannins has been advocated as a anism by which plants can defend themselves against a vari mammalian herbivores, including against those that feed or lypt foliage (Marsh et al., 2003; DeGabriel et al., 2009). A concentrations, in a broad sense, PAs have a greater capaci gallotannins or ellagitannins to precipitate protein, alt accurate compound-specific studies with PAs are scarce (H 1988; Kilkowski & Gross, 1999; Salminen & Karonen, The tannin profiles of many of the eucalypts that we are were dominated by ellagitannins, with some having contions > 100 mg g<sup>-1</sup> (Fig. 2a; Marsh *et al.*, 2017a). In this tion, higher concentrations may compensate for



Fig. 2 The relationship between the oxidative activity of eucalypt leaves and the two polyphenol constituents that had the strongest correlation with this measurement  $(n = 628)$ : (a) hexahydroxydiphenoyl (HHDP) derivatives, and (b) prodelphinidin subunits from large proanthocyanidins (PAs). Note that these relationships are indicative only, because they do not take into account other covariates or phylogenetic correlations from the statistical model.

bioactivity, and can make a significant contribution to protein precipitation capacity (Johnson et al., 2014). This probably explains why the protein precipitation capacity of eucalypt extracts was most strongly correlated with the concentration of late-eluting HHDP derivatives, and then secondarily with the concentrations of procyanidin subunits in large PAs and prodelphinidin subunits in medium-sized PAs.

Our finding that the concentration of late-eluting HHDP derivatives had a greater impact on protein precipitation capacity compared with early-eluting derivatives supports previous work that individual ellagitannins can differ greatly in their capacity to precipitate protein (Salminen et al., 2011; Moilanen et al., 2013). Purified ellagitannins with greater protein precipitation capacity tend to elute later during reversed-phase LC analyses due to their greater structural flexibility, lower water solubility and higher molecular mass (Salminen et al., 2011; Moilanen et al., 2013; Karonen et al., 2015; Engström et al., 2019). The following four structural features primarily increase the protein precipitation capacity and retention time of ellagitannins: the number of galloyl, HHDP and other functional groups attached to the central glucose core; the presence of two galloyls instead of one HHDP

that is formed by C-C coupling of the two galloyls; the pi of a central glucopyranose unit instead of acyclic glucose; a oligomerisation degree of the ellagitannin (Engström 2019). Thus, separately integrating early- and late-eluting tannins in complex mixtures of unidentified ellagitannins provide useful information about the proportional bic activity of these compounds. In addition, their elution p could give a hint of their structures that could be then veri UV and MS spectra (Moilanen et al., 2013).

Quantifying PAs within different size classes (i.e. the Enmethod; Engström et al., 2014; Salminen, 2018b) coul improve our understanding of how different mixtures affect biological activity. The statistical models for all thr logical activities identified correlations between biological a and specific size classes of PA subunits, rather than total c trations. This suggests that we need a better understanding biological activities of individual PAs, and again illustrate understanding the relationship between biological activi tannins is so difficult in plant samples; variation in tannin position, even within subgroups of tannins, influences bio activity.

©2019 The Authors



# New Phyto

Table 4 Final statistical model showing the phenolic constituents that had a significant effect on oxidative activity.



Degrees of freedom for all *t*-statistics is 563 ( $n = 626$ ).

HHDP, hexahydroxydiphenoyl derivatives; mDP of PAs, mean degree of polymerisation of proanthocyanidins.

Some of the eucalypt samples in our study possessed very high oxidative activity (up to  $94 \text{ mg g}^{-1}$  DM gallic acid equivalents). This is at the higher end of values that have been reported in other plant species (Vihakas et al., 2014, 2015). In theory, the oxidative capacity of polyphenols could affect plant resistance to insect herbivory (Appel, 1993), but this has yet to be demonstrated conclusively. Oxidative polyphenols may a more effective against some insect species than against othe example, in two species of lepidopteran larvae, A aurantiaria was much more efficient than Epirrita autum. metabolising pentagalloylglucose, a model hydrolysable (Salminen, 2018a). Interestingly, even though A. aura



Fig. 3 The relationship between the ca to reduce the in vitro nitrogen (N) digestibility of eucalypt leaves and (a) proportion of proanthocyanidins (PAs comprising prodelphinidin, and (b) the degree of polymerisation (mDP) of proanthocyanidins ( $n = 628$ ). Note that relationships are indicative only, becal they do not take into account other covariates or phylogenetic correlation the statistical model.

New Phytologist (2019)

New approaches to tannin analysis of leaves can be used to explain in vitro biological activitie... Page 16 of 22

www.newpnytologist.com

Table 5 Final statistical model showing the phenolic constituents that significantly influenced the square root of the capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility.



Degrees of freedom for all *t*-statistics is 566 ( $n = 627$ ).

mDP of PAs = mean degree of polymerisation of proanthocyanidins.

appears to have a higher gut pH than E. autumnata (Kim et al., 2018), pentagalloylglucose was not more harmful to A. aurantiaria. While we learn more of plant chemistry, we should also examine the effects on herbivores, because plant chemistry alone cannot reveal the fate of the compounds in herbivores.

Eucalypts could be an ideal system in which to test hypotheses that relate oxidative activity to insect herbivory because there is wide variation in oxidative activity between eucalypt species (this study) and between individuals within species (Marsh et al., 2017b), a variety of insect herbivores feed on eucalypt foliage (Fox & Morrow, 1981; Paine et al., 2011), and herbivory by insects differs between eucalypt species and individuals (Fox & Macauley, 1977; Paine et al., 2011; Marsh et al., 2017b). If oxidative activity does deter herbivory by some insects, our results suggest that the most likely eucalypts to benefit would be those containing high concentrations of ellagitannins, as well as prodelphinidin subunits in large PAs. Caffeic acid derivatives, such as caffeoyl quinic acids, are also efficiently oxidised at high pH, and by plant oxidative enzymes (Kim et al., 2018). These compounds could be important in eucalypts as well, because quinic acid derivatives partially determined the oxidative activity of eucalypt extracts.

The fact that ellagitannin concentrations had strong effects on both protein precipitation capacity and oxidative activity probably explains why there was a positive correlation between the two biological activities. On the surface, this suggests that plants containing high concentrations of ellagitannins might be somewhat protected against both mammalian (through protein binding) and insect (through oxidation) herbivores. However, before making these sorts of assumptions, we need a better understanding of the relationship between specific in vitro activity and the in vivo effects of tannins on herbivores. This is particularly pertinent given that ellagitannin concentrations did not affect the capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility, even though they affected protein precipitation capacity.

This is the first study to investigate the particular structural features of tannins that correlate with changes in in vitro N digestibility, which can affect habitat quality and the reproductive success of marsupial folivores (DeGabriel et al., 2009; Youngentob et al., 2011). The results suggest that PAs might be particularly important in influencing in vitro N digestibility. Despite our expectations, different tannin subgroups affected the capacity to reduce in vitro N digestibility relative to

©2019 The Authors  $\ddot{\phantom{a}}$  $\sim$  in vitro protein precipitation capacity. The capacity to in vitro N digestibility was strongly positively correlate the proportion of prodelphinidin subunits in PAs, an mDP of PAs. Both of these factors have previously been to influence protein precipitation capacity generally (e.g. et al., 1976; Porter & Woodruffe, 1984; Kumar & Hor 1986; Osborne & McNeill, 2001; Lokvam & Kursar, Huang et al., 2011; Saminathan et al., 2014), which n surprising that there was a negative relationship betwe protein precipitation capacity of eucalypt samples ar mDP of PAs. Nevertheless, this could be due to a negati relation between the mDP of PAs and the concentrat late-eluting HHDP derivatives (data not shown). It wo useful to know what happens to the hydrolysable tant samples during the digestible N assay, such as whethe dissociate from protein or hydrolyse in response to the conditions, because they clearly precipitate protein in th tein precipitation capacity assay.

 $\overline{\mathbf{R}}$ 

The results of our study demonstrate that the biologica ity of tannin mixtures in plants is a complex trait relying of eral classes of compounds and, probably, many ind structures, as well as the specific conditions and proteins er tered after ingestion by a herbivore. Despite recent breakth in identifying genes underlying some aspects of tannin sti (e.g. Liu et al., 2016), there are unlikely to be genes of large that explain this biological activity (Kulheim et al., 2011). mand et al. (2018) argue that the genes responsible for synthesis could act as keystone genes influencing many eco processes, but the complexity of tannin composition in fo tion trees, such as eucalypts, suggests that genes of large eff not likely.

## Conclusions

Our study shows that the tannin composition of plant of affects their biological activity. In particular, it is possible cidate the broad structural features that contribute to bio activity, even when each individual compound in a comple ture has not been identified. This is important, because firms that the new analytical techniques utilised here coul valuable tool allowing researchers to understand how the c sition of a widespread group of plant secondary metabolite as the tannins influences the ecology of both individuals an ulations of herbivores. It also suggests that future studi-

# 10 Research

characterise the individual tannins in specific subgroups could provide more detailed insight into the major patterns revealed in the current work.

## **Acknowledgements**

We thank the volunteers who assisted with the collection of leaf samples, and Ms Anne Koivuniemi, Ms Anni Savolainen, Ms Tiina Buss and Ms Hannah Wigley for assisting with laboratory analyses. This work was supported by grants from the Australian Research Council to KJM (DE120101263) and to WJF and IRW (DP0986142), and from the Academy of Finland to JPS  $(258992).$ 

## **Author contributions**

WJF, IRW and J-PS conceived the idea. DN and IRW collected the samples, and KJM and J-PS conducted the chemical assays. KJM, CK and RC analysed the data. KJM led the writing of the manuscript, with contributions from all other authors.

## **ORCID**

Robert Clark D https://orcid.org/0000-0003-4368-5145 William J. Foley D https://orcid.org/0000-0001-8587-1814 Carsten Kulheim D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-0798-3324 Karen J. Marsh D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-9699-8033 Juha-Pekka Salminen D https://orcid.org/0000-0002-2912-7094

## **References**

- Aerts R, Barry T, McNabb W. 1999. Polyphenols and agriculture: beneficial effects of proanthocyanidins in forages. Agriculture, Ecosystems and Environment  $75:1 - 12.$
- Appel H. 1993. Phenolics in ecological interactions: the importance of oxidation. Journal of Chemical Ecology 19: 1521-1552.
- Ayres M, Clausen T, MacLean S, Redman A, Reichardt P. 1997. Diversity of structure and antiherbivore activity in condensed tannins. Ecology 78: 1696-1712.
- Barbehenn R, Cheek S, Gasperut A, Lister E, Maben R. 2005. Phenolic compounds in red oak and sugar maple leaves have prooxidant activities in the midgut fluids of Malacosoma disstria and Orgyia leucostigma caterpillars. Journal of Chemical Ecology 31: 969-988.
- Barbehenn RV, Constabel PC. 2011. Tannins in plant-herbivore interactions. Phytochemistry 72: 1551-1565.
- Barbehenn RV, Jones CP, Hagerman AE, Karonen M, Salminen JP. 2006. Ellagitannins have greater oxidative activities than condensed tannins and galloyl glucoses at high pH: potential impact on caterpillars. Journal of Chemical Ecology 32: 2253-2267.
- Barbehenn RV, Niewiadomski J, Pecci C, Salminen J-P. 2013. Physiological benefits of feeding in the spring by Lymantria dispar caterpillars on red oak and sugar maple leaves: nutrition versus oxidative stress. Chemoecology 23: 59-70.
- Barbehenn R, Weir Q, Salminen JP. 2008. Oxidation of ingested phenolics in the tree-feeding caterpillar Orgyia leucostigma depends on foliar chemical composition. Journal of Chemical Ecology 34: 748-756.
- Bayly MJ, Rigault P, Spokevicius A, Ladiges PY, Ades PK, Anderson C, Bossinger G, Merchant A, Udovicic F, Woodrow IE et al. 2013. Chloroplast genome analysis of Australian eucalypts - Eucalyptus, Corymbia, Angophora,

New Phytologist (2019)

Allosyncarpia and Stockwellia (Myrtaceae). Molecular Phylogenetics and 1 69:704-716.

New

Phyte

- DeGabriel JL, Moore BD, Foley WJ, Johnson C. 2009. The effects of pl: defensive chemistry on nutrient availability predict reproductive success mammal. Ecology 90: 711-719.
- DeGabriel JL, Wallis IR, Moore BD, Foley WJ. 2008. A simple, integrat to quantify nutritional quality of browses for herbivores. Oecologia 156: 116.
- Engström MT, Arvola J, Nenonen S, Virtanen VTJ, Leppä MM, Tähtin Salminen JP. 2019. Structural features of hydrolyzable tannins determi ability to form insoluble complexes with bovine serum albumin. Journa Agricultural and Food Chemistry 67: 6798-6808.
- Engström MT, Palijarvi M, Fryganas C, Grabber JH, Mueller-Harvey I, Salminen JP. 2014. Rapid qualitative and quantitative analyses of proanthocyanidin oligomers and polymers by UPLC-MS/MS. Journal Agricultural and Food Chemistry 62: 3390-3399.
- Engström MT, Palijarvi M, Salminen JP. 2015. Rapid fingerprint a of plant extracts for ellagitannins, gallic acid, and quinic acid deriv and quercetin-, kaempferol- and myricetin-based flavonol glycosides UPLC-QqQ-MS/MS. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry 6: 4068-4079.
- Felton AM, Wam HK, Stolter C, Mathisen KM, Wallgren M. 2018. Th complexity of interacting nutritional drivers behind food selection, a renorthern cervids. Ecosphere 9: e02230.
- Fox L, Macauley B. 1977. Insect grazing on Eucalyptus in response to vari leaf tannins and nitrogen. Oecologia 29: 145-162.
- Fox LR, Morrow PA. 1981. Specialization species property or local phenomenon. Science 211: 887-893.
- Hagerman AE. 1987. Radial diffusion method for determining tannin in extracts. Journal of Chemical Ecology 13: 437-449.
- Haslam E. 1988. Plant polyphenols (syn. vegetable tannins) and chemical - a reappraisal. Journal of Chemical Ecology 14: 1789-1805.
- Huang XD, Liang JB, Tan HY, Yahya R, Long R, Ho YW. 2011. Protei binding affinity of Leucaena condensed tannins of differing molecular w Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry 59: 10677-10682.
- Johnson MTJ, Ives AR, Ahern J, Salminen J-P. 2014. Macroevolution of defenses against herbivores in the evening primroses. New Phytologist 20 279.
- Jones W, Broadhurst R, Lyttleton J. 1976. The condensed tannins of pas legume species. Phytochemistry 15: 1407-1409.
- Jones R, Palmer B. 2000. In vitro digestion studies using <sup>14</sup>C-labelled polyethylene glycol (PEG) 4000: comparison of six tanniferous shrub k and the grass Panicum maximum. Animal Feed Science and Technology 8  $221.$
- Karonen M, Oraviita M, Mueller-Harvey I, Salminen JP, Green RJ. 201 Binding of an oligomeric ellagitannin series to bovine serum albumin (l analysis by isothermal titration calorimetry (ITC). Journal of Agricultur. Food Chemistry 63: 10647-10654.
- Kawamoto H, Nakatsubo F, Murakami K. 1996. Stoichiometric studies tannin-protein co-precipitation. Phytochemistry 41: 1427-1431.
- Kilkowski WJ, Gross GG. 1999. Color reaction of hydrolyzable tannins v Bradford reagent, Coomassie brilliant blue. Phytochemistry 51: 363-366
- Kim J, Palijarvi M, Karonen M, Salminen JP. 2018. Oxidatively active p phenolics detected by UHPLC-DAD-MS after enzymatic and alkaline oxidation. Journal of Chemical Ecology 44: 483-496.
- Kulheim C, Yeoh SH, Wallis IR, Laffan S, Moran GF, Foley WJ. 2011. molecular basis of quantitative variation in foliar secondary metabolites Eucalyptus globulus. New Phytologist 191: 1041-1053.
- Kumar R, Horigome T. 1986. Fractionation, characterization, and protei precipitating capacity of the condensed tannins from Robinia pseudo aci leaves. Journal of Agricultural and Food Chemistry 34: 487-489.
- Liu CG, Wang XQ, Shulaev V, Dixon RA. 2016. A role for leucoanthocy reductase in the extension of proanthocyanidins. Nature Plants 2: 1618.
- Lokvam J, Kursar TA. 2005. Divergence in structure and activity of phen defenses in young leaves of two co-occurring Inga species. Journal of Ch Ecology 31: 2563-2580.

- Makkar HPS. 2003. Effects and fate of tannins in ruminant animals, adaptation to tannins, and strategies to overcome detrimental effects of feeding tannin-rich feeds. Small Ruminant Research 49: 241-256
- Marsh KJ, Kulheim C, Blomberg SP, Thornhill AH, Miller JT, Wallis IR, Nicolle D, Salminen J-P, Foley WJ. 2017a. Genus-wide variation in foliar polyphenolics in eucalypts. Phytochemistry 144: 197-207.
- Marsh KJ, Wallis IR, Foley WJ. 2003. The effect of inactivating tannins on the intake of Eucalyptus foliage by a specialist Eucalyptus folivore (Pseudocheirus peregrinus) and a generalist herbivore (Trichosurus vulpecula). Australian Journal of Zoology 51: 31-42.
- Marsh KJ, Zhou W, Wigley HJ, Foley WJ. 2017b. Oxidizable phenolic concentrations do not affect development and survival of Paropsis atomaria larvae eating Eucalyptus foliage. Journal of Chemical Ecology 43:  $411 - 421$
- Martin M, Rockholm D, Martin J. 1985. Effects of surfactants, pH, and certain cations on precipitation of proteins by tannins. Journal of Chemical Ecology 11: 485-494
- Masette M, Isabirye-Basuta G, Baranga D, Chapman CA, Rothman JM. 2015. The challenge of interpreting primate diets: mangabey foraging on Blighia unijugata fruit in relation to changing nutrient content. African Journal of Ecology 53: 259-267.
- McArt S, Spalinger D, Collins W, Schoen E, Stevenson T, Bucho M. 2009. Summer dietary nitrogen availability as a potential bottom-up constraint on moose in south-central Alaska. Ecology 90: 1400-1411.
- McManus J, Davis K, Beart J, Gaffney S, Lilley T, Haslam E. 1985. Polyphenol Interactions. Part 1. Introduction; some observations on the reversible compexation of polyphenols with proteins and polysaccharides. Journal of the Chemical Society, Perkin Transactions 2: 1429-1438.
- Moilanen J, Karonen M, Tahtinen P, Jacquet R, Quideau S, Salminen JP. 2016. Biological activity of ellagitannins: effects as anti-oxidants, pro-oxidants and metal chelators. Phytochemistry 125: 65-72.
- Moilanen J, Salminen JP. 2008. Ecologically neglected tannins and their biologically relevant activity: chemical structures of plant ellagitannins reveal their in vitro oxidative activity at high pH. Chemoecology 18: 73-83.
- Moilanen J, Sinkkonen J, Salminen J-P. 2013. Characterization of bioactive plant ellagitannins by chromatographic, spectroscopic and mass spectrometric methods. Chemoecology 23: 165-179.
- Moore BD, Wallis IR, Marsh KJ, Foley WJ. 2004. The role of nutrition in the conservation of the marsupial folivores of eucalypt forests. In: Lunney D, ed. Conservation of Australia's forest fauna. Mossman, NSW, Australia: Royal Zoological Society of New South Wales, 549-575.
- Mueller-Harvey I. 2006. Unravelling the conundrum of tannins in animal nutrition and health. Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture 86: 2010-2037
- Osborne N, McNeill D. 2001. Characterization of Leucaena condensed tannins by size and protein precipitation capacity. Journal of the Science of Food and Agriculture 81: 1113-1119.
- Paine TD, Steinbauer MJ, Lawson SA. 2011. Native and exotic pests of Eucalyptus: a worldwide perspective. Annual Review of Entomology 56: 181-201
- Paradis E, Claude J, Strimmer K. 2004. APE: analyses of phylogenetics and evolution in R language. Bioinformatics 20: 289-290.
- Pinheiro J, Bates D, DebRoy S, Sarkar D, R Core Team. 2017. nlme: Linear and nonlinear mixed effects models. R package v. 2.1-131. [WWW document] URL https://CRAN.R-project.org/package=nlme [accessed 1 August 2017].
- Porter L, Woodruffe J. 1984. Haemanalysis: the relative astringency of proanthocyanidin polymers. Phytochemistry 23: 1255-1256.
- Robbins C, Hanley T, Hagerman A, Hjeljord O, Baker D, Schwartz C, W. 1987. Role of tannins in defending plants against ruminants: reduc protein avaiability. Ecology 68: 98-107.
- Roslin T, Salminen JP. 2008. Specialization pays off: contrasting effects of types of tannins on oak specialist and generalist moth species. Oikos 11', 1560-1568.
- Salminen JP. 2018a. Metabolism of <sup>14</sup>C-labelled pentagalloylglucose by i autumnata and Agriopis aurantiaria (Lepidoptera: Geometridae) and implications for the nutrition of geometrid defoliators. Austral Entomol  $255 - 264$
- Salminen JP. 2018b. Two-dimensional tannin fingerprints by liquid chromatography tandem mass spectrometry offer a new dimension to p tannin analyses and help to visualize the tannin diversity in plants. Jour. Agricultural and Food Chemistry 66: 9162-9171.
- Salminen JP, Karonen M. 2011. Chemical ecology of tannins and other phenolics: we need a change in approach. Functional Ecology 25: 325-3
- Salminen JP, Karonen M, Sinkkonen J. 2011. Chemical ecology of tanni recent developments in tannin chemistry reveal new structures and struactivity patterns. Chemistry-A European Journal 17: 2806-2816.
- Saminathan M, Tan H, Sieo C, Abdullah N, Wong C, Abdulmalek E, H 2014. Polymerization degrees, molecular weights and protein-binding a of condensed tannin fractions from a Leucaena leucocephala hybrid. Mo 19:7990-8010
- Schofield P, Mbugua D, Pell A. 2001. Analysis of condensed tannins: a re Animal Feed Science and Technology 91: 21-40.
- Silanikove N, Shinder D, Gilboa N, Eyal M, Nitsan Z. 1996. Binding of (ethylene glycol) to samples of forage plants as an assay of tannins and t negative effects on ruminal degradation. Journal of Agricultural and Foo Chemistry 44: 3230-3234.
- Skovmand LH, Xu CCY, Servedio MR, Nosil P, Barrett RDH, Hendry 2018. Keystone genes. Trends in Ecology and Evolution 33: 689-700.
- Steinbauer MJ, Farnier K, Taylor GS, Salminen JP. 2016. Effects of euca nutritional quality on the Bog gum-Victorian metapopulation of Ctena bipartita and implications for host and range expansion. Ecological Ento  $41:211 - 225.$
- Vihakas M, Gomez I, Karonen M, Tahtinen P, Saaksjarvi I, Salminen JI Phenolic compounds and their fates in tropical lepidopteran larvae: modifications In alkaline conditions. Journal of Chemical Ecology 41: 82
- Vihakas M, Pälijärvi M, Karonen M, Roininen H, Salminen J-P. 2014. estimation of the oxidative activities of individual phenolics in crude pl: extracts. Phytochemistry 103: 76-84.
- Volf M, Hrcek J, Julkunen-Tiitto R, Novotny V. 2015. To each its own: differential response of specialist and generalist herbivores to plant defer willows. Journal of Animal Ecology 84: 1123-1132.
- Wang Z, Cao L, Zhang Z. 2014. Seed traits and taxonomic relationships determine the occurrence of mutualisms versus seed predation in a trop forest rodent and seed dispersal system. Integrative Zoology 9: 309-319.
- Windley HR, Barron MC, Holland EP, Starrs D, Ruscoe WA, Foley WJ Foliar nutritional quality explains patchy browsing damage caused by a invasive mammal. PLoS ONE 11: e0155216.
- Youngentob KN, Wallis IR, Lindenmayer DB, Wood JT, Pope ML, Fol 2011. Foliage chemistry influences tree choice and landscape use of a gl marsupial folivore. Journal of Chemical Ecology 37: 71-84.

©2019 The Authors